

Contents

Acknowledgements — VII

Chapter 1

The Trilemma — 1

- 1.1 Moral Conviction — 3
- 1.2 Moral Uncertainty — 14
- 1.3 The Trilemma — 20
- 1.4 Objections and Clarifications — 23
- 1.5 Chapter Overview — 32

Chapter 2

Normative Compatibility — 36

- 2.1 Historical Precedent for Normative Compatibility — 37
- 2.2 Arguments for Normative Compatibility — 41
- 2.3 Objections to Normative Compatibility — 48
- 2.4 Conclusion — 65

Chapter 3

Moral Necessity — 66

- 3.1 The Moral Necessity Account — 69
- 3.2 Non-doxastic Moral Conviction as Moral Necessity — 75
- 3.3 Against Williams' Horizontal Model — 77
- 3.4 Modifying Frankfurt's Hierarchical Account — 84
- 3.5 The Modified Hierarchical Account and Doxastic Moral Certainty — 90
- 3.6 Conclusion — 99

Chapter 4

Commitment, Certainty, and Fanaticism — 100

- 4.1 The Voluntary Commitment Account — 101
- 4.2 Fundamental Commitment and the Ideal Moral Response — 106
- 4.3 The Fanaticism Charge — 112
- 4.4 Conclusion — 121

Chapter 5

Justified Moral Certainty — 123

- 5.1 Certainty and its Relation to Belief and Knowledge — **127**
- 5.2 Infallibly Justified Certainty and the Modal Status of Moral Heroes' Relevant Moral Views — **131**
- 5.3 Infallibilist Certainty: First Pass — **138**
- 5.4 Infallibilist Certainty: Externalism to the Rescue? — **145**
- 5.5 Fallibilist Certainty — **166**
- 5.6 Conclusion — **187**

Chapter 6

Defeaters — 191

- 6.1 Realist Rebuttals — **192**
- 6.2 The Naiveté Approach — **196**
- 6.3 Defeat Scepticism — **198**
- 6.4 Higher-Order Considerations and Level-Splitting — **203**
- 6.5 Conclusion — **217**

Chapter 7

Solving the Trilemma — 218

- 7.1 Steadfastness and Self-Trust — **219**
- 7.2 Practical Encroachment on Epistemic Status — **224**
- 7.3 Morally Disabled Defeaters — **228**
- 7.4 Why Accept Morally Disabled Defeaters? — **231**
- 7.5 Advantages of the Account — **237**
- 7.6 Conclusion: Solving the Trilemma — **242**

References — 244

Index Nominum — 257

Index Rerum — 258